

PATENTS IN THE KNOWLEDGE-BASED E C O N O M Y

102

NATIONAL RESEARCH COUNCIL

OF THE NATIONAL ACADEMIES

HS DATENT & 122 583

PATENTS LIBERTY

Wesley M. Cohen and Stephen A. Merrill, Editors

Committee on Intellectual Property Rights in the Knowledge-Based Economy Board on Science, Technology, and Economic Policy Policy and Global Affairs

NATIONAL RESEARCH COUNCIL
OF THE NATIONAL ACADEMIES

THE NATIONAL ACADEMIES PRESS Washington, D.C. www.nap.edu

THE NATIONAL ACADEMIES PRESS • 500 Fifth Street, N.W. • Washington, DC 20001

NOTICE: The project that is the subject of this report was approved by the Governing Board of the National Research Council, whose members are drawn from the councils of the National Academy of Sciences, the National Academy of Engineering, and the Institute of Medicine. The members of the committee responsible for the report were chosen for their special competences and with regard for appropriate balance.

This study was supported by Contract No. NASW-99037, Task Order 103. between the National Academy of Sciences and the National Aeronautics and Space Administration, the Department of Commerce, Andrew W. Mellon Foundation, Center for Public Domain, Pharmacia Corporation, Merck & Company, Procter & Gamble, and IBM. Any opinions, findings, conclusions, or recommendations expressed in this publication are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily reflect the views of the organizations or agencies that provided support for the project.

International Standard Book Number 0-309-08636-1 (Book) International Standard Book Number 0-309-50941-6 (PDF)

Limited copies are available from:

Board on Science, Technology, and Economic Policy National Research Council 500 Fifth Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20001

Phone: 202-334-2200 Fax: 202-334-1505

Additional copies of this report are available from the National Academies Press, 2101 Constitution Avenue, N.W., Lockbox 285. Washington, D.C. 20055; (800) 624-6242 or (202) 334-3313 (in the Washington metropolitan area); Internet, http://www.nap.edu

Copyright 2003 by the National Academy of Sciences. All rights reserved. Printed in the United States of America

The cover design incorporates original illustration from the following U.S. patents issued over a nearly 160-year period:

- U.S. Patent 6,506,554; Core structure of gp41 from the HIV envelope glycoprotein; Chan, David C. (Brookline, MA); Fass, Deborah (Cambridge, MA); Lu, Min (New York, NY); Berger, James M., (Cambridge, MA); Kim, Peter S. (Lexington, MA); Granted January 14, 2003.
- U.S. Patent 6,423,583; Methodology for electrically induced selective breakdown of nanotubes; Avouris. Phaedon (Yorktown Heights, NY); Collins, Philip G. (Ossining, NY); Martel, Richard (Peekskill, NY); Granted July 23, 2003.
- U.S. Patent 6,313,562; Microelectromechanical ratcheting apparatus; Barnes, Stephen M. (Albuquerque, NM); Miller, Samuel L. (Albuquerque, NM); Jensen, Brian D. (Albuquerque, NM); Rodgers, M. Steven (Albuquerque, NM); Burg, Michael S., (Albuquerque, NM); Granted November 6,2001.
- U.S. Patent 821,393; Flying machine; Wright, Orville (Dayton, OH) and Wright, Wilbur (Dayton, OH); Granted May 22, 1906.
- U.S. Patent 223,898; Electric lamp; Edison, Thomas A. (Menlo Park, NJ); Granted January 27, 1880. U.S. Patent 4750; Improvement in sewing machines; Howe, Jr., Elias, (Cambridge, MA); Granted September 10, 1846.

Contents

troduction	
Wesley M. Cohen and Stephen A. Merrill	1
Patent Quality	
Are All Patent Examiners Equal? Examiners, Patent Characteristics, and Litigation Outcomes Iain M. Cockburn, Samuel Kortum, and Scott Stem	19
Patent Examination Procedures and Patent Quality	54
Patent Quality Control: A Comparison of U.S. Patent Re-examinations and European Patent Oppositions Stuart J.H. Graham, Bronwyn H. Hall, Dietmar Harhoff, and David C. Mowery	74
Benefits and Costs of an Opposition Process Jonathan Levin and Richard Levin	120
Patent Litigation	
Enforcement of Patent Rights in the United States	145

xii CONTENTS

Patent Litigation in the U.S. Semiconductor Industry Rosemarie Ham Ziedonis	180
Patents in Software and Biotechnology	
Intellectual Property Protection in the U.S. Software Industry Stuart J.H. Graham and David C. Mowery	219
Internet Business Method Patents	259
Effects of Research Tool Patents and Licensing on Biomedical Innovation	285